MAY 25, 2017

# Setting up Acceptance Criteria with the Application of Equivalence Test and Geometric Mean Following USP Chapters - A Cell-based Potency Assay Case Study

**PRESENTED BY:** 

**Liming Shi** 





# Outline

- Background information
- Assay DOE optimization
- Ready-to-use cell banks/method qualification
- Data driven and stage-appropriate acceptance criteria set up
- Control trending
- Summary and acknowledgement



### **USP recommendations**

- Equivalence test has been recommended by USP for parallelism evaluation
  - Currently most popular F-test has obvious drawbacks
  - Assays with very good precision will fail parallelism test, but assays with poor precision may pass parallelism using *F*-test
- Geometric mean has been recommended by USP for final reportable result calculation
  - > Majority of bioassay results are not normal distributed
  - Geometric mean will be better to address skewed results and be closer to true value



#### **Biological products**





# **Biological products (cont.)**

| Market Name | Drug Type                        | Mechanism of<br>Action              | Indication                     | Company              | Sales in 2014 |
|-------------|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------|---------------|
| Humira      | Mab                              | Anti-TNFa                           | Psoriasis, RA etc.             | Abbvie               | \$12.54 b     |
| Sovaldi     | Small Molecule                   | HCV Polymerase<br>Inhibitor         | HCV Infection                  | Gilead               | \$10.28 b     |
| Remicade    | Chimeric Mab                     | Anti-TNFa                           | Psoriasis, RA etc.             | Johnson &<br>Johnson | \$9.24 b      |
| Rituxan     | Chimeric Mab                     | Anti-CD20                           | Lymphoma, Leukemia<br>etc.     | Roche                | \$8.68 b      |
| Enbrel      | Fusion Protein                   | Bind TNFa                           | Psoriasis, RA etc.             | Amgen                | \$8.54 b      |
| Lantus      | Insulin Glargine                 | Long Acting<br>Insulin              | Diabetes                       | Sanofi               | \$7.28 b      |
| Avastin     | Mab                              | Anti-VEGF-A                         | Colon Cancer etc.              | Roche                | \$6.96 b      |
| Herceptin   | Mab                              | Anti-Her-2                          | Breast Cancer etc.             | Roche                | \$6.79 b      |
| Advair      | Small Molecule                   | Ease constriction<br>of the airways | Asthma etc.                    | GSK                  | \$6.43 b      |
| Crestor     | Small Molecule                   | Inhibit HMG-CoA<br>Reductase        | High Cholesterol               | AstraZeneca          | \$5.87 b      |
| Neulasta    | Pegylated<br>Recombinant Protein | Boosting White<br>Blood Cells       | Infection and<br>Neutropenia   | Amgen                | \$5.86 b      |
| Abilify     | Small Molecule                   | Dopamine Agonist                    | Depression and<br>Bipolar etc. | BMS                  | \$5.27 b      |





### Ready-to-use (R2U) cell line in the assay

- Ready-to-use cells have advantages over continuous cell culture
  - Eliminate routine laborious cell culture work
  - > No drifting of cell quality due to cell passages
- The range of passage numbers of R2U cell bank have to be qualified
- Pfizer drug X is a recombinant factor which will stimulate dosedependent cell proliferation in the assay
- Passage 7 R2U WCB had been used in original titration, DOE optimization and first method qualification
- Three additional Working Cell Banks (P5, P8 and P11) were made.
   P5 and P11 were used for R2U/method qualification



#### Assay plate map (after titration)

| Plate 1 |      | -    |       | -    | _    | -    | -     | -    |      | -    |       |      |
|---------|------|------|-------|------|------|------|-------|------|------|------|-------|------|
|         | 1    | 2    | 3     | 4    | 5    | 6    | 7     | 8    | 9    | 10   | 11    | 12   |
| А       |      |      |       |      |      |      |       |      |      |      |       |      |
| В       | d a  |      |       |      | q a  |      |       |      | qa   |      |       |      |
| С       | ndar | ŋ    | ā     |      | ndar | ŋ    | ŋ     |      | ndar | ŋ    | ŋ     | σ    |
| D       | Star | le 1 | ole 2 |      | Star | le 1 | ole 2 |      | Star | le 1 | ole 2 | rol  |
| E       | JCe  | amp  | dme   | Cont | JCe  | amp  | amp   | Cont | JCe  | dme  | amp   | Cont |
| F       | erer | Ň    | Š     | 0    | erer | č,   | Š     | 0    | erer | ů,   | Š     | 0    |
| G       | Ref  |      |       |      | Ref  |      |       |      | Ref  |      |       |      |
| Н       |      |      |       |      |      |      |       |      |      |      |       |      |

| PI | ate | 2 |
|----|-----|---|
|----|-----|---|

| Plate Z |      |       |       |      |      |       |       |      |      |       |       |      |
|---------|------|-------|-------|------|------|-------|-------|------|------|-------|-------|------|
|         | 1    | 2     | 3     | 4    | 5    | 6     | 7     | 8    | 9    | 10    | 11    | 12   |
| А       |      |       |       |      |      |       |       |      |      |       |       |      |
| В       | d b  |       |       |      | q p. |       |       |      | q p. |       |       |      |
| С       | ndar | q     | q     | q    | ndar | q     | q     | ą    | ndar | q     | q     | q    |
| D       | Star | ole 1 | ole 2 | ol 2 | Star | ole 1 | ole 2 | 0 2  | Star | ole 1 | ole 2 | ol 2 |
| E       | JCe  | dme   | dme   | ontr | JCe  | dme   | dme   | ontr | JCe  | dme   | dme   | ontr |
| F       | erer | Š     | Š     | Ŭ    | erer | S     | Š     | Ū    | erer | S     | Š     | Ŭ    |
| G       | Ref  |       |       |      | Ref  |       |       |      | Ref  |       |       |      |
| Н       |      |       |       |      |      |       |       |      |      |       |       |      |

| Plate 3 | _         | -     |       |         | _      |       |       |         |          |       |         |         |
|---------|-----------|-------|-------|---------|--------|-------|-------|---------|----------|-------|---------|---------|
|         | 1         | 2     | 3     | 4       | 5      | 6     | 7     | 8       | 9        | 10    | 11      | 12      |
| А       |           |       |       |         |        |       |       |         |          |       |         |         |
| В       | с<br>,q с |       |       |         | с<br>g |       |       |         | с<br>q с |       |         |         |
| С       | Idar      | ų     | U.    | сı<br>L | Jdar   | ų     | U.    | сı<br>L | ndar     | ų     | сı<br>L | сı<br>I |
| D       | Star      | ole 1 | ole 2 | ol 2    | Star   | ole 1 | ole 2 | ol 2    | Star     | ole 1 | ole 2   | ol 2    |
| E       | JCe       | amp   | amp   | ontı    | JCe    | amp   | ame   | onti    | JCe      | amp   | amp     | ontı    |
| F       | erei      | Ň     | Ň     | Ŭ       | erei   | Ň     | Š     | Ŭ       | erei     | Š     | Š       | Ŭ       |
| G       | Ref       |       |       |         | Ref    |       |       |         | Ref      |       |         |         |
| н       |           |       |       |         |        |       |       |         |          |       |         |         |





### **Optimization DOE design with 16 runs**

| : 🖼 🔚 💋 📓 🖻   | ••• • • • • • | 10 20 | Ľx 🚈 🖉      | Ŧ          |     |       |
|---|---------------|-------|-------------|------------|-----|-------|
| <ul> <li>1st DOE HSP-130</li> <li>Design Custom Desi</li> </ul> |               | Cell  | Stimulation | Incubation | S/N | EC50  |
| Criterion I Optin   | nal 1         | 7500  | 27          | 24         | 3.2 | 0.352 |
| <ul> <li>Screening</li> </ul>                                   | 2             | 10000 | 30          | 24         | 3.9 | 0.388 |
| Model   | 3             | 10000 | 24          | 24         | 3   | 0.277 |
| DOE Dialog  | 4             | 10000 | 24          | 16         | 3.1 | 0.307 |
|   | 5             | 5000  | 30          | 16         | 3.2 | 0.626 |
|   | 6             | 5000  | 30          | 24         | 2.6 | 0.4   |
|   | 7             | 10000 | 30          | 16         | 3.9 | 0.375 |
|   | 8             | 5000  | 27          | 20         | 2.8 | 0.395 |
|   | 9             | 7500  | 27          | 20         | 3.5 | 0.373 |
|   | 10            | 7500  | 27          | 20         | 3.4 | 0.351 |
|   | 11            | 5000  | 24          | 24         | 2.2 | 0.3   |
|   | 12            | 7500  | 30          | 20         | 4   | 0.328 |
|   | 13            | 5000  | 24          | 16         | 2.2 | 0.313 |
|   | 14            | 10000 | 27          | 20         | 3.9 | 0.406 |
|   | 15            | 7500  | 24          | 20         | 2.6 | 0.265 |
| Columns (5/0)   | 16            | 7500  | 27          | 16         | 3.1 | 0.275 |





### **Critical parameters in the assay**



#### **Sorted Parameter Estimates**

| Term                    | Estimate  | Std Error | t Ratio | Prob> t |
|-------------------------|-----------|-----------|---------|---------|
| Cell(5000,10000)        | 0.48      | 0.066894  | 7.18    | 0.0004* |
| Stimulation(24,30)      | 0.45      | 0.066894  | 6.73    | 0.0005* |
| Incubation*Incubation   | -0.253448 | 0.130283  | -1.95   | 0.0997  |
| Incubation(16,24)       | -0.06     | 0.066894  | -0.90   | 0.4043  |
| Cell*Incubation         | 0.0625    | 0.07479   | 0.84    | 0.4353  |
| Stimulation*Incubation  | -0.0625   | 0.07479   | -0.84   | 0.4353  |
| Stimulation*Stimulation | -0.103448 | 0.130283  | -0.79   | 0.4574  |
| Cell*Stimulation        | 0.0375    | 0.07479   | 0.50    | 0.6339  |
| Cell*Cell               | -0.053448 | 0.130283  | -0.41   | 0.6959  |



#### **Sorted Parameter Estimates**

| Term                    | Estimate  | Std Error | t Ratio | Prob> t |
|-------------------------|-----------|-----------|---------|---------|
| Stimulation(24,30)      | 0.0655    | 0.020073  | 3.26    | 0.0172* |
| Cell*Cell               | 0.0743966 | 0.039093  | 1.90    | 0.1057  |
| Cell(5000,10000)        | -0.0281   | 0.020073  | -1.40   | 0.2111  |
| Cell*Stimulation        | -0.02925  | 0.022442  | -1.30   | 0.2402  |
| Cell*Incubation         | 0.02775   | 0.022442  | 1.24    | 0.2625  |
| Stimulation*Incubation  | -0.02125  | 0.022442  | -0.95   | 0.3803  |
| Incubation(16,24)       | -0.0179   | 0.020073  | -0.89   | 0.4069  |
| Stimulation*Stimulation | -0.029603 | 0.039093  | -0.76   | 0.4776  |
| Incubation*Incubation   | -0.012603 | 0.039093  | -0.32   | 0.7581  |





### **DOE optimized final conditions**





#### **Finalized assay conditions**



Log Concentration (ng/mL)

- Dilution scheme is 1:7 of 8-dose serial dilutions with starting concentration of 375 ng/mL
- 9500 cells/well; 30 hr stimulation and 21 hr substrate incubation





#### **Full curve analysis**





### Full curve analysis using *F*-test



*F*-test may factor out weighting and it is less sensitive

- If fit extremely well, the denominator will be very small, therefore, it will fail parallelism
- If fit not well, the denominator will be large and it may pass parallelism



Parallelism evaluation using *F*-test

> F stat must be  $\leq$  F critical value of 7.591 ( $\alpha$  = 0.01 with numerator DF of 3 and denominator DF of 8)

#### Relative potency recovery

Sample and control relative potency must be within 70% to 130% to its target relative potency





### **Qualification: Accuracy, Repeatability and IP**

| Analyst      | DOLL Coll Donk               | Plata                 |      |      | Sample | _    |      |
|--------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|------|------|--------|------|------|
| Analyst      | RZU Geli Balik               | Plate                 | 50   | 75   | 100    | 125  | 150  |
|              |                              | 1-3                   | 57.3 | 87.1 | 99.6   | 128  | 145  |
|              |                              | 4-6                   | 56.3 | 87.5 | 92.8   | 121  | 143  |
|              | Passago 5                    | 7-9                   | 55.1 | 87.0 | 100    | 126  | 134  |
|              | Fassaye J                    | Mean                  | 56.2 | 87.2 | 97.5   | 125  | 141  |
|              |                              | Repeatability %RSD    | 1.96 | 0.30 | 4.15   | 2.88 | 4.17 |
| ٨            |                              | Accuracy/Recovery (%) | 112  | 116  | 97.5   | 100  | 93.8 |
| ~            |                              | 1-3                   | 47.9 | 78.0 | 98.6   | 126  | 177  |
|              |                              | 4-6                   | 40.2 | 67.2 | 103    | 129  | 172  |
|              | Decesso 11                   | 7-9                   | 49.7 | 68.5 | 95.9   | 115  | 165  |
|              | rassaye II                   | Mean                  | 45.9 | 71.2 | 99.2   | 123  | 171  |
|              |                              | Repeatability %RSD    | 11.0 | 8.28 | 3.61   | 5.98 | 3.52 |
|              |                              | Accuracy/Recovery (%) | 91.9 | 95.0 | 99.2   | 98.7 | 114  |
|              |                              | 1-3                   | 49.1 | 67.7 | 111    | 126  | 163  |
|              |                              | 4-6                   | 51.6 | 67.3 | 109    | 136  | 145  |
|              | Decesso 5                    | 7-9                   | 47.0 | 69.6 | 108    | 137  | 144  |
|              | Passaye 5                    | Mean                  | 49.2 | 68.2 | 109    | 133  | 151  |
|              |                              | Repeatability %RSD    | 4.68 | 1.80 | 1.40   | 4.57 | 7.10 |
| C            |                              | Accuracy/Recovery (%) | 98.5 | 90.9 | 109    | 106  | 100  |
| U            |                              | 1-3                   | 46.3 | 80.0 | 113    | 123  | 174  |
|              |                              | 4-6                   | 48.2 | 96.4 | 103    | 124  | 165  |
|              | Decesso 11                   | 7-9                   | 43.5 | 87.4 | 107    | 123  | 180  |
|              | Passage 11                   | Mean                  | 46.0 | 87.9 | 108    | 123  | 173  |
|              |                              | Repeatability %RSD    | 5.14 | 9.34 | 4.67   | 0.47 | 4.36 |
|              |                              | Accuracy/Recovery (%) | 92.0 |      | 108    | 98.7 | 115  |
| Intermediate | Precision (P5, P11 for analy | rst A, C; n=4)        | 9.80 | 13.2 | 5.72   | 3.78 | 9.80 |



### **Qualification: Linearity and Specificity**





### Assay trending program (ATP)

- Trending program is very important
  - Increases assay consistency and quality
  - Decreases assay failure and repeat
- Establish trending program
  - Assay condition is finalized and accumulate enough assay results
  - Calculate control limits in control chart
- The Shewart control chart provides the tool to distinguish between the two types of variation in a process
  - Common cause variation (random)
  - Special cause variation (root cause)



### Assay trending program (cont.)

| A          | 8       | c           | P                       | Q                  | 1                  | 5               | 1                  | U        | V.    | W     | X        | Y       | z                        | AA                                   | -A8             | AC .            | AD            | Æ              | Al            | AL            |       |
|------------|---------|-------------|-------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------|-------|-------|----------|---------|--------------------------|--------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|---------------|----------------|---------------|---------------|-------|
| Assay Date | Analyst | Sample 10   | Auerage<br>Signal Noise | A<br>Unconstrained | 8<br>Unconstrained | C Unconstrained | D<br>Unconstrained | A        |       | ¢     | 0        | Max/Min | Individual<br>ReiPot (%) | Recovery<br>Reportable<br>Result (N) | 95%-CI<br>Lower | 95% Cl<br>Upper | Ftest<br>Prob | F Test<br>Stat | Note          | Starting conc |       |
| 26-May-16  | н       | CTRL 1      | 3.7                     | 3.368+06           | 0.825              | 0.474           | 1,238+07           | 3.385+06 | 0.836 | 0.52  | 1245+07  | 3.67    | 108                      |                                      | 0.695           | 1.464           | 0.991         | 0.035          | Qualification | 575           | CMB   |
| 26-May-16  | H       | 6PO         | 3.7                     | 3.44E+06           | 78.04              | 0.055           | 3.385+06           | 3.415+06 | 0.862 | 0.594 | 1.24E+07 | 3.64    | 0                        |                                      | -4.068-07       | 4.066-07        | 0.796         | 0.342          | Qualification | 375           | CM8   |
| 26-May-16  | 28      | Ranibizumab | 3.7                     | 3.568+06           | 34.28              | 2.781           | 3.368+06           | 3.458+06 | 0.97  | 0.512 | 1.216+07 | 3.51    | 0                        |                                      | -3.286-05       | 3.285-05        | 0.319         | 1.374          | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | CTRL 1      | 35                      | 3.228+06           | 0.742              | 0.578           | 1.095+07           | 3.158+06 | 0.666 | 0.453 | 1.116-07 | 3.52    | 110                      |                                      | 0.7             | 1.502           | 0.485         | 0.891          | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | CTRL 2      | 35                      | 3.025+06           | 0.508              | 0.445           | 1.156+07           | 5.02E+06 | 0.628 | 0.422 | 1.115+07 | 3.68    | 103                      |                                      | 0.666           | 1.405           | 0.811         | 0.32           | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | CTRL 3      | 3.5                     | 3.066+06           | 0.637              | 0.435           | 1.096+07           | 3.11E+06 | 0.693 | 0.403 | 1.076+07 | 3.44    | 106                      | 106                                  | 0.702           | 1.409           | 0.253         | 1.651          | Qualification | 375           | CM8   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 1-1  | 3.5                     | 3.196+06           | 0.741              | 0.682           | 1.07E+07           | 3.14E+06 | 0.661 | 0.438 | 1.106+07 | 3.50    | 55.8                     |                                      | 0.36            | 0.756           | 0.275         | 1.559          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 1-2  | 3.5                     | 3.145+06           | 0.665              | 0.827           | 1.105+07           | 3.09E+06 | 0.659 | 0.405 | 1.105-07 | 3.56    | 51.4                     |                                      | 0.353           | 0.674           | 0.958         | 0.1            | Qualification | 575           | CM8   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 1-3  | 3.5                     | 3,168+06           | 0.725              | 0.678           | 1.058+07           | 3.165+06 | 0.737 | 0.367 | 1.055+07 | 3.52    | 55.7                     | 109                                  | 0.429           | 0.684           | 0.968         | 0.082          | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 2-1  | 3.5                     | 3.075+06           | 0.648              | 0.284           | 1.105+07           | 3.08E+06 | 0.627 | 0,456 | 1.126+07 | 3.64    | 148                      |                                      | 0.75            | 2.204           | 0.918         | 0.164          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 2-2  | 3.5                     | 3.76E+06           | 0.727              | 0.321           | 1.095+07           | 3.358+06 | 0.671 | 0.458 | 1.096+07 | 3.25    | 174                      |                                      | 0.57            | 2.915           | 0.505         | 0.852          | Qualification | 375           | CMB P |
| 2-Jun-15   | GD      | Sample 2-3  | 3.5                     | 3.158+06           | 0.713              | 0.261           | 1.065+07           | 3.158+06 | 0.731 | 0.377 | 1.055+07 | 3.35    | 152                      | 105                                  | 1.177           | 1.855           | 0.782         | 0.362          | Qualification | 375           | CMBR  |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | CTRL 1      | 3.6                     | 3.128+06           | 0.683              | 0.46            | 1.115+07           | 3.128+06 | 0.691 | 0.42  | 1.096+07 | 3.49    | 300                      |                                      | 0.645           | 1.548           | 0.653         | 0.566          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | CTRL 2      | 3.6                     | 3.105+06           | 0.746              | 0.317           | 1.085+07           | 3.108+06 | 0.705 | 0.384 | 1.096+07 | 3.52    | 115                      |                                      | 0.802           | 1.505           | 0.819         | 0.308          | Qualification | 375           | CMB P |
| 2-lun-16   | GD      | CTRL 3      | 3.6                     | 3.106+06           | 0.641              | 0.392           | 1.156+07           | 3.10E+06 | 0.575 | 0.367 | 1.166+07 | 3.74    | 86.6                     | 101                                  | 0.49            | 1.242           | 0.557         | 0.74           | Qualification | 375           | CM8   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 1-1  | 5.6                     | 3.196+06           | 0.751              | 0.769           | 1.095+07           | 5.168+06 | 0.725 | 0.402 | 1.085+07 | 3.42    | 54.7                     |                                      | 0.578           | 0.715           | 0.811         | 0.52           | Qualification | 575           | CMBR  |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 1-2  | 3.6                     | 3.228+06           | 0.734              | 0.751           | 1.085+07           | 3.162+06 | 0.7   | 0,398 | 1.096+07 | 3.45    | 51.7                     |                                      | 0.359           | 0.676           | 0.906         | 0.181          | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 1-3  | 3.6                     | 3.196+06           | 0.645              | 0.873           | 1.146+07           | 3.158+06 | 0.58  | 0.373 | 1.16E+07 | 3.68    | 40                       | 97.6                                 | 0.287           | 0.512           | 0.254         | 1.753          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 2-1  | 3.6                     | 3.065+06           | 0.698              | 0.249           | 1.095+07           | 3.09E+06 | 0.699 | 0.394 | 1.085+07 | 3.50    | 161                      |                                      | 0.983           | 2.228           | 0.942         | 0.126          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 2-2  | 3.6                     | 3.076+06           | 0.682              | 0.265           | 1.105+07           | 3.098+06 | 0.676 | 0.402 | 1.105+07 | 3.56    | 150                      |                                      | 0.928           | 2.08            | 0.995         | 0.028          | Qualification | 575           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | GD      | Sample 2-3  | 3.6                     | 3.008+06           | 0.622              | 0.294           | 1.146+07           | 3.048+06 | 0.566 | 0.34  | 1.156-07 | 3.78    | 301                      | 91.6                                 | 0.626           | 1,395           | 0.455         | 1.07           | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-lun-16   | H       | CTRL 1      | 3.5                     | 3.086+06           | 0.651              | 0.722           | 1,215+07           | 3.185+06 | 0.711 | 0.714 | 1.176+07 | 3.68    | 114                      |                                      | 0.722           | 1.561           | 0.151         | 2.328          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-lun-16   | 24      | CTRL 2      | 3.5                     | 3.186+06           | 0.695              | 0.606           | 1.155+07           | 5.208+06 | 0.739 | 0.562 | 1.136+07 | 3.55    | 91.4                     |                                      | 0.606           | 1.222           | 0.701         | 0.487          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | 34      | CTRL 3      | 3.5                     | 3.048+06           | 0.732              | 0.661           | 1.115+07           | 3.09E+06 | 0.705 | 0.803 | 1.11E+07 | 3.59    | 117                      | 107                                  | 0.791           | 1.542           | 0.797         | 0.341          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | 28      | Sample 1-1  | 35                      | 3.27E+06           | 0.833              | 1.263           | 1.146+07           | 3.275+06 | 0.81  | 0.622 | 1.14E+07 | 3.49    | 48.9                     |                                      | 0.371           | 0.607           | 0.948         | 0.116          | Qualification | 375           | CM8   |
| 2-Jun-16   | 28      | Sample 1-2  | 3.5                     | 3.176+06           | 0.758              | 1.508           | 1.168+07           | 3.19E+06 | 0.774 | 0.592 | 1.14E+07 | 3.57    | 47.6                     |                                      | 0.332           | 0.621           | 0.898         | 0.193          | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | . 28    | Sample 1-3  | 3.5                     | 3.196+06           | 0.747              | 1.695           | 1.125+07           | 3.176+06 | 0.714 | 0.873 | 1.125+07 | 3.53    | 53.6                     | 100                                  | 0.582           | 0.69            | 0.606         | 0.649          | Qualification | 575           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | 24      | Sample 2-1  | 3.5                     | 3.16E+06           | 0.725              | 0.407           | 1.176+07           | 5.22E+06 | 0.754 | 0.655 | 1.15E+07 | 3.57    | 168                      |                                      | 1.215           | 2.145           | 0.705         | 0.48           | Qualification | 575           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | н       | Sample 2-2  | 3.5                     | 3.166+06           | 0.82               | 0.386           | 1.125+07           | 3.196+06 | 0.805 | 0.545 | 1.13E+07 | 3.54    | 135                      |                                      | 0.908           | 1.795           | 0.951         | 0.111          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-15   | 26      | Sample 2-3  | 3.5                     | 3.146+06           | 0.783              | 0.52            | 1.095+07           | 3.14E+06 | 0.726 | 0.784 | 1.106+07 | 3.50    | 342                      | 98.9                                 | 1.012           | 1.825           | 0.652         | 0.568          | Qualification | 375           | CMBR  |
| 2-Jun-16   | 28      | CTRL 1      | 3.8                     | 3,138+06           | 0.686              | 0.696           | 1.205+07           | 5.138+06 | 0.656 | 0.725 | 1245+07  | 3.96    | 87.8                     |                                      | 0.44            | 1.515           | 0.614         | 0.634          | Qualification | 375           | CM8 P |
| 2-Jun-16   | H       | CTRL 2      | 3.8                     | 3.00E+06           | 0.559              | 1,108           | 1.315+07           | 3.085+06 | 0.62  | 0.854 | 1.276+07 | 4.12    | 92.9                     |                                      | 0.478           | 1.38            | 0.709         | 0,474          | Qualification | 375           | CMB P |
| 2-Jun-16   | 38      | CTRL 3      | 3.8                     | 3.228+06           | 0.692              | 0.624           | 1.138+07           | 3.22E+06 | 0.734 | 0.554 | 1.156+07 | 3.51    | 89.4                     | 90.0                                 | 0.595           | 1.194           | 0.762         | 0.393          | Qualification | 375           | CM8   |
| 2-lun-16   | 28      | Sample 1-1  | 3.8                     | 3.206+06           | 0.712              | 1.495           | 1.215+07           | 3.168+06 | 0.664 | 0.768 | 1.256+07 | 3.96    | 44.7                     |                                      | 0.274           | 0.619           | 0.711         | 0.47           | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | н       | Sample 1-2  | 3.8                     | 3.115+06           | 0.718              | 1.545           | 1.208+07           | 5.125+06 | 0.696 | 0.688 | 1.225+07 | 5.91    | 46.9                     |                                      | 0.296           | 0.642           | 0.91          | 0.176          | Qualification | 575           | CMB   |
| 2-Jun-16   | н       | Sample 1-3  | 3.8                     | 3.20E+06           | 0.763              | 1.296           | 1168+07            | 3.21E+06 | 0.773 | 0.588 | 1.14E+07 | 3.55    | 49                       | 95.7                                 | 0.338           | 0.643           | 0.652         | 0.567          | Qualification | 375           | CMB   |
| 2-lun-16   | 14      | Sample 3-1  | 18                      | 1145-05            | 0.68               | 0.467           | 1205-07            | 1145-06  | 0.659 | 0715  | 1215+07  | 8.92    | 181                      |                                      | 0.725           | 1.885           | 0.416         | 1.065          | Qualification | 875           | CMER  |





### System suitability/Control Trending



UCL=120.75 120 110 RelPot (%) Avg=99.77 00 90 80 LCL=78.80 06/15/2016-05/20/2016-05/20/2016-05/26/2016 06/02/2016 06/16/2016 06/23/2016 06/23/2016-10/03/2016 03/21/2017-04/04/2017-Assay Date

| Capability Anal  | ysis  |               |          |
|------------------|-------|---------------|----------|
| Specification    | Value | Portion       | % Actual |
| Lower Spec Limit | 70    | Below LSL     | 0.0000   |
| Spec Target      | 100   | Above USL     | 0.0000   |
| Upper Spec Limit | 130   | Total Outside | 0.0000   |

#### Long Term Sigma



| Capability Analysis |       |               |          |  |  |  |  |
|---------------------|-------|---------------|----------|--|--|--|--|
| Specification       | Value | Portion       | % Actual |  |  |  |  |
| Lower Spec Limit    | 70    | Below LSL     | 0.0000   |  |  |  |  |
| Spec Target         | 100   | Above USL     | 0.0000   |  |  |  |  |
| Upper Spec Limit    | 130   | Total Outside | 0.0000   |  |  |  |  |

#### Long Term Sigma



| Capability | Index Lo | ower Cl | Uppe | er Cl   |
|------------|----------|---------|------|---------|
| СР         | 1.430    | 1.139   | 1    | .721    |
| CPK        | 1.419    | 1.114   | 1    | .725    |
| CPM        | 1.430    | 1.154   | 1    | .736    |
| CPL        | 1.419    | 1.114   | 1    | .723    |
| CPU        | 1.441    | 1.131   | 1    | .749    |
|            |          |         |      | Sigma   |
| Portion    | Percer   | ıt      | PPM  | Quality |
| Below LSL  | 0.001    | 0 10.   | 2903 | 5.758   |
| Above USL  | 0.000    | 0 7     | 6050 | 5 0 7 2 |





### Full curve analysis using equivalence test

Similarity is demonstrated when:

 $a_t/a_s$ ;  $b_t/b_s$ ; and  $d_t/d_s$  fall within preset acceptance criteria

For one bioassay example:

| Acceptance<br>Parameter | Sample Size<br>(N) | Mean  | Standard Deviation | LAL  | UAL  |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------|--------------------|------|------|
| $\mathbf{R}^2$          | 680                | 0.991 | 0.007              | 0.97 | 1.00 |
| $a_{S}/a_{R}$           | 452                | 0.984 | 0.042              | 0.85 | 1.15 |
| $d_{S}/d_{R}$           | 452                | 0.983 | 0.983              | 0.80 | 1.20 |
| $b_{S}/b_{R}$           | 452                | 0.956 | 0.163              | 0.55 | 1.45 |

Amgen, Inc., Frank Ye 2005



### **Concept of equivalence test**

- Switch the null and alternative hypothesis
- Set up data driven pre-determined goalposts
- Equivalence test: two-one sided t-test (TOST)
- The two null hypothesis will be rejected if



 $\theta$  is the goalpost which is predetermined



# Comparison of traditional hypothesis test and equivalence test







#### Assessment of tolerance interval for lower asymptote



| Parameter Estimates                   |             |           |           |           |  |  |
|---------------------------------------|-------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|--|--|
| Туре                                  | Parameter   | Estimate  | Lower 95% | Upper 95% |  |  |
| Location                              | μ           | 0.9981102 | 0.992859  | 1.0033615 |  |  |
| Dispersion                            | σ           | 0.0424959 | 0.0390937 | 0.0465517 |  |  |
| -2log(Likelihood) = -884.619940417157 |             |           |           |           |  |  |
| Goodne                                | ss-of-Fit T | est       |           |           |  |  |

Shapiro-Wilk W Test W Prob<W 0.778798 <.0001\*

Note: Ho = The data is from the Normal distribution. Small p-values reject Ho.

#### **Custom Quantiles**

| Quantiles |          |           |           |          |  |
|-----------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|--|
|           |          |           |           | Actual   |  |
| Quantile  | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% | Coverage |  |
| 0.5%      | 0.79825  | 0.79      | 1.25      | 72.01    |  |
| 50%       | 1        | 1         | 1         | 95.51    |  |
| 99.5%     | 1.23625  | 0.79      | 1.25      | 72.01    |  |

#### **Smoothed Empirical Likelihood Quantiles**

| Quantile | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% |
|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| 0.5%     | 0.81754  | 0.78853   | 0.84794   |
| 50%      | 1.00019  | 0.99821   | 1.00232   |
| 99.5%    | 1.20145  | 1.07212   | 1.25147   |





### Assessment of tolerance interval for slope



#### **Fitted Normal**

| Parameter Estimates                   |           |           |           |           |  |
|---------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|--|
| Туре                                  | Parameter | Estimate  | Lower 95% | Upper 95% |  |
| Location                              | μ         | 1.0020866 | 0.9903283 | 1.013845  |  |
| Dispersion                            | σ         | 0.0951553 | 0.0875373 | 0.1042368 |  |
| -2log(Likelihood) = -475,119930272204 |           |           |           |           |  |

#### Goodness-of-Fit Test

Shapiro-Wilk W Test

W Prob<W

0.976338 0.0003

Note: Ho = The data is from the Normal distribution. Small p-values reject Ho.

#### **Custom Quantiles**

Quantiles

|          |          |           |           | Actual   |
|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|
| Quantile | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% | Coverage |
| 0.5%     | 0.81     | 0.81      | 1.32      | 72.01    |
| 50%      | 0.99     | 0.98      | 1         | 95.51    |
| 99.5%    | 1.31175  | 0.81      | 1.32      | 72.01    |

#### Smoothed Empirical Likelihood Quantiles

| Quantile | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% |
|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| 0.5%     | 0.80732  | 0.80173   | 0.81609   |
| 50%      | 0.99133  | 0.97996   | 1.00369   |
| 99.5%    | 1.29534  | 1.24719   | 1.32541   |







#### Fitted Normal

| Parameter Estimates |           |          |           |           |  |  |
|---------------------|-----------|----------|-----------|-----------|--|--|
| Туре                | Parameter | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% |  |  |

| Location $\mu$                        | 0.9984646 | 0.9955629 | 1.0013662 |  |  |  |
|---------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|--|--|--|
| Dispersion σ                          | 0.0234817 | 0.0216018 | 0.0257227 |  |  |  |
| -2log(Likelihood) = -1185.95943688135 |           |           |           |  |  |  |

#### Goodness-of-Fit Test

Shapiro-Wilk W Test

W Prob<W

0.976098 0.0003\*

Note: Ho = The data is from the Normal distribution. Small p-values reject Ho.

#### **Custom Quantiles**

| - |    |     |    |
|---|----|-----|----|
| 1 |    | • • | 00 |
| v | ua | LII | C3 |
|   | _  |     |    |

|          |          |           |           | Actual   |
|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|----------|
| Quantile | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% | Coverage |
| 0.5%     | 0.911    | 0.9       | 1.06      | 72.01    |
| 50%      | 1        | 1         | 1         | 95.51    |
| 99.5%    | 1.06     | 0.9       | 1.06      | 72.01    |

#### Smoothed Empirical Likelihood Quantiles

| Quantile | Estimate | Lower 95% | Upper 95% |
|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| 0.5%     | 0.93866  | 0.89865   | 0.94845   |
| 50%      | 0.99982  | 0.99786   | 1.00165   |
| 99.5%    | 1.05923  | 1.04368   | 1.06179   |





### AC based on non-parametric tolerance interval

- The distribution of parameters of a, b, d are not normal
- Data transformations are not normal distributed either
- The ratios of parameters a, b, d to reference standard were chosen for acceptance criteria set up
- Non-parametric tolerance intervals for a, b, d were calculated from 267 data points generated using reference standard material
  - addressing pure analytical variation

| Ratio of parameter | Acceptance Range |  |  |  |
|--------------------|------------------|--|--|--|
| a/a'               | 0.85 - 1.07      |  |  |  |
| b/b'               | 0.82 - 1.25      |  |  |  |
| d/d'               | 0.95–1.04        |  |  |  |



#### **Reportable results control strategy**

- Arithmetic mean of three independent assay results
  - > %RSD criterion among three independent assay results (e.g. ≤20% RSD)
- Weighted mean of three independent assay results
  - > %RSD criterion among three independent assay results (e.g. ≤20% RSD)
- Geometric mean of three independent assay results
  - Confidence interval criterion for three independent assay results



The weighted mean is calculated as

$$\overline{M} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{3} (W_i M_i)}{\sum_{i=1}^{3} W_i}$$

- The individual result with less variation will have more influence on the final reportable result than the individual result with larger variation
- An acceptance criterion for the weighted mean is determined by %RSD the same as for an arithmetic mean



#### **Geometric mean**

- The data log transformation generates normal distributed results
- Therefore, geometric mean addresses better for skewed results and is closer to true value
- The Geometric Mean calculation

Geometric Mean = e<sup>in RP1+in RP2+in RP3</sup>

 Geometric Mean is controlled by the confidence interval (e.g. 75% to 133%)



#### **Reportable result calculation using geometric mean**

| В                               | С   | D  | E   | F | G  | Н  |                                      | J   | K  | L   | М  | Ν   | 0   | Р   |
|---------------------------------|---|--|---|---|--|--|--------------------------------------|---|--|---|--|---|---|---|
| Comple                          | Sample  |  |   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| Sample                          | Plate 1   | Plate 2  | Plate 3   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| 1                               | 56.7  | 52.3   | 46.9  |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| 2                               | 152   | 158  | 168   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| 3                               | 69.5  | 70.2   | 74.7  |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| 4                               | 126   | 125  | 135   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| 5                               | 101   | 105  | 108   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
| 6                               | 106   | 110  | 104   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
|                                 |   |  |   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   |  |   |   |   |
|                                 |   |  |   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  | Antilog   |  |   |   |   |
|                                 |   |  |   |   |  |  |                                      |   |  |   | Ant  | ilog  |   |   |
| Sample                          | Plate 1   | Plate 2  | Plate 3   |   | Average  | SD   | n                                    | LL  | UL   | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)   | Ant<br>LL  | ilog<br>UL  | Relative 95%<br>CI LL   | Relative 95%<br>CI UL   |
| Sample                          | Plate 1<br>4.0377742  | Plate 2<br>3.9569964   | Plate 3<br>3.848017675  |   | Average<br>3.9475961   | SD<br>0.0952269  | n<br>3                               | LL<br>3.7110394   | UL<br>4.1841528  | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)<br>51.810669  | Ant<br>LL<br>40.896292   | ilog<br>UL<br>65.637868   | Relative 95%<br>CI LL<br>78.934113  | Relative 95%<br>CI UL<br>126.68794  |
| Sample                          | Plate 1<br>4.0377742<br>5.0238805   | Plate 2<br>3.9569964<br>5.062595   | Plate 3<br>3.848017675<br>5.123963979   |   | Average<br>3.9475961<br>5.0701465  | SD<br>0.0952269<br>0.0504672   | n<br>3<br>3                          | LL<br>3.7110394<br>4.9447789  | UL<br>4.1841528<br>5.1955141   | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)<br>51.810669<br>159.19765   | Ant<br>LL<br>40.896292<br>140.4398   | ilog<br>UL<br>65.637868<br>180.4609   | Relative 95%<br>CI LL<br>78.934113<br>88.217256   | Relative 95%<br>CI UL<br>126.68794<br>113.35651   |
| Sample 1 2 3                    | Plate 1<br>4.0377742<br>5.0238805<br>4.2413268  | Plate 2<br>3.9569964<br>5.062595<br>4.2513483  | Plate 3<br>3.848017675<br>5.123963979<br>4.313480092  |   | Average<br>3.9475961<br>5.0701465<br>4.2687184                                       | SD<br>0.0952269<br>0.0504672<br>0.0390873  | n<br>3<br>3<br>3                     | LL<br>3.7110394<br>4.9447789<br>4.1716202                                       | UL<br>4.1841528<br>5.1955141<br>4.3658166  | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)<br>51.810669<br>159.19765<br>71.430031  | Ant<br>LL<br>40.896292<br>140.4398<br>64.820388  | ilog<br>UL<br>65.637868<br>180.4609<br>78.71365                                       | Relative 95%<br>CI LL<br>78.934113<br>88.217256<br>90.746689  | Relative 95%<br>CI UL<br>126.68794<br>113.35651<br>110.19686  |
| Sample<br>1<br>2<br>3<br>4      | Plate 1<br>4.0377742<br>5.0238805<br>4.2413268<br>4.8362819                           | Plate 2<br>3.9569964<br>5.062595<br>4.2513483<br>4.8283137                           | Plate 3<br>3.848017675<br>5.123963979<br>4.313480092<br>4.905274778                               |   | Average<br>3.9475961<br>5.0701465<br>4.2687184<br>4.8566235                          | SD<br>0.0952269<br>0.0504672<br>0.0390873<br>0.0423212                           | n<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3                | LL<br>3.7110394<br>4.9447789<br>4.1716202<br>4.7514918                          | UL<br>4.1841528<br>5.1955141<br>4.3658166<br>4.9617552                           | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)<br>51.810669<br>159.19765<br>71.430031<br>128.58928                           | Ant<br>LL<br>40.896292<br>140.4398<br>64.820388<br>115.75684                           | ilog<br>UL<br>65.637868<br>180.4609<br>78.71365<br>142.8443                           | Relative 95%<br>CI LL<br>78.934113<br>88.217256<br>90.746689<br>90.020594                           | Relative 95%<br>CI UL<br>126.68794<br>113.35651<br>110.19686<br>111.08569                           |
| Sample<br>1<br>2<br>3<br>4<br>5 | Plate 1<br>4.0377742<br>5.0238805<br>4.2413268<br>4.8362819<br>4.6151205              | Plate 2<br>3.9569964<br>5.062595<br>4.2513483<br>4.8283137<br>4.6539604              | Plate 3<br>3.848017675<br>5.123963979<br>4.313480092<br>4.905274778<br>4.682131227                |   | Average<br>3.9475961<br>5.0701465<br>4.2687184<br>4.8566235<br>4.650404              | SD<br>0.0952269<br>0.0504672<br>0.0390873<br>0.0423212<br>0.0336466              | n<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3      | LL<br>3.7110394<br>4.9447789<br>4.1716202<br>4.7514918<br>4.5668212             | UL<br>4.1841528<br>5.1955141<br>4.3658166<br>4.9617552<br>4.7339868              | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)<br>51.810669<br>159.19765<br>71.430031<br>128.58928<br>104.62725              | Ant<br>LL<br>40.896292<br>140.4398<br>64.820388<br>115.75684<br>96.237704              | ilog<br>UL<br>65.637868<br>180.4609<br>78.71365<br>142.8443<br>113.74816              | Relative 95%<br>CI LL<br>78.934113<br>88.217256<br>90.746689<br>90.020594<br>91.981491              | Relative 95%<br>CI UL<br>126.68794<br>113.35651<br>110.19686<br>111.08569<br>108.71752              |
| Sample 1 2 3 4 5 6              | Plate 1<br>4.0377742<br>5.0238805<br>4.2413268<br>4.8362819<br>4.6151205<br>4.6634391 | Plate 2<br>3.9569964<br>5.062595<br>4.2513483<br>4.8283137<br>4.6539604<br>4.7004804 | Plate 3<br>3.848017675<br>5.123963979<br>4.313480092<br>4.905274778<br>4.682131227<br>4.644390899 |   | Average<br>3.9475961<br>5.0701465<br>4.2687184<br>4.8566235<br>4.650404<br>4.6694368 | SD<br>0.0952269<br>0.0504672<br>0.0390873<br>0.0423212<br>0.0336466<br>0.0285217 | n<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3<br>3 | LL<br>3.7110394<br>4.9447789<br>4.1716202<br>4.7514918<br>4.5668212<br>4.598585 | UL<br>4.1841528<br>5.1955141<br>4.3658166<br>4.9617552<br>4.7339868<br>4.7402886 | Reportable<br>Result<br>(geometric<br>Mean)<br>51.810669<br>159.19765<br>71.430031<br>128.58928<br>104.62725<br>106.63767 | Ant<br>LL<br>40.896292<br>140.4398<br>64.820388<br>115.75684<br>96.237704<br>99.343645 | ilog<br>UL<br>65.637868<br>180.4609<br>78.71365<br>142.8443<br>113.74816<br>114.46723 | Relative 95%<br>CI LL<br>78.934113<br>88.217256<br>90.746689<br>90.020594<br>91.981491<br>93.159996 | Relative 95%<br>CI UL<br>126.68794<br>113.35651<br>110.19686<br>111.08569<br>108.71752<br>107.34221 |





### **Finalized acceptance criteria**

- Assay acceptance criteria
  - Control sample must pass equivalence test for parallelism
  - The relative potency of control sample must be within the range of 70% to 130% of the reference standard
  - The upper/lower asymptote in constrained model must be equal or larger than 3
- Sample acceptance criteria
  - Sample must pass equivalence test for parallelism
  - The relative potency of sample must be within the qualified range of 50% to 150% of the reference standard
  - The upper/lower asymptote in constrained model must be equal or larger than 3
- 90% confidence interval of the final reportable result must be within 75% to 133%





### Summary

- The cell-based potency assay and R2U cell banks have been successfully optimized and qualified
- Both the parallelism evaluation and the final reportable result have been adopted according to the recommendations from the most recent USP chapter 1033
- The acceptance criteria have been set up based on accumulated historical data
- Cell-based potency assay is a critical analytical test in CMC package. Traditional method has to be evolved to meet the higher regulatory and industry standards



#### Acknowledgement

- Jackie Hoang
- Ana Marija Plavec
- Glenn Deaver
- Bioassay group
- Bioanalytical Sciences
- Richard Montes
- Julie TerWee
- Cathy Srebalus Barnes



